

PPOL 4991: Policies for Conflict and Peace in Northern Ireland

2020 Undergraduate Capstone for Batten Students

Instructor: Paul Martin (pmartin@virginia.edu); office: L035

Travel Fellow: Patti Edson (pls8n@virginia.edu)

Meets: On Grounds before and after Spring Break; TBA
In Ireland/Northern Ireland, March 7-15 (Spring Break)

Background:

This course investigates the development of conflict in Northern Ireland, the institutional reforms embedded in the peace process culminating in the 1998 Good Friday Agreement, the stability of the peace in the ensuing years, and the strains placed on the peace by the Brexit vote in 2016. We investigate how elites re-crafted political institutions for power-sharing, how economic opportunities for employment are critical to the peace process, and how the ongoing historical meaning of “the Troubles” is contested. This class includes a spring break field study in Ireland and N. Ireland., with specific attention to Dublin, Derry, and Belfast. We examine the internal dynamics of the conflict, the political actors involved in the conflict, and external events (and actors) that influence the dynamics.

Beginning in 1968 and officially ending with the 1998 Good Friday Agreement, “The Troubles” took the lives of more than 3,500 people from violence perpetrated by both sides of the conflict. The meaning and reasoning behind the conflict are themselves sources of contested history. Some see the conflict as understandable through an ethno-nationalist lens, others see a religious conflict, and others see a civil rights struggle that turned violent. This class meets directly with current political leaders (including members of the Irish Parliament, Belfast and Derry city governments), former IRA and paramilitary combatants (including senior leaders involved in the 1980 hunger strikes), eyewitnesses and victims of historic atrocities (Bloody Sunday, 1972; Omagh Bombing, 1998), and with contemporary actors working desperately to keep the hard-won peace intact.

While the 1998 Good Friday Agreement is frequently seen as a success story for peace making, the agreement is not without problems and may hinder full integration of the critical ethnic, religious, and political actors. Most recently, the decision by the United Kingdom to exit the European Union brings the fragility of the peace agreement back into the spotlight. Nationalist parties in Northern Ireland have called for additional votes for reunification, and decisions about the external borders of the European Union and the United Kingdom have the possibility to reignite older conflicts about the border between Ireland and Northern Ireland.

*is still in me at what I saw. His brow
was blown open above the eye and blood
had dried on his neck and cheek. ‘Easy now,’*

*he said, ‘it’s only me. You’ve seen men as raw
after a football match What time it was
when I was wakened up I still don’t know*

but I heard this knocking, knocking, and it

*scared me like the phone in the small hours,
so I had the sense not to put on the light*

*but looked out from behind the curtain
I saw two customers on the doorstep
and an old landrover with its doors openⁱ*

How is this class different to others you may have taken?

A capstone course should call on us to bring our knowledge together from multiple parts of our undergraduate education. The projects should allow you to incorporate prior knowledge and attack problems with your fullest set of tools.

A capstone also recognizes that this is the last semester of your undergraduate career. I will expect you to step away from any pretence of passive learning. You will teach yourselves, one another, and me.

*My tongue moved, a swung relaxing hinge
I said to her, 'What will become of us?'
As a forgotten water in a well might shake
At an explosion under morningⁱⁱ*

Key dates

W3: Group 1 leads discussion; Groups 3 & 4 present problems

W4: Visiting Scholars from Queens University/Belfast; Groups 1 & 2 present problems

W5: Group 2 leads discussion; Groups 3 & 4 present stakeholders

W6: Group 3 leads discussion; Groups 1 & 2 present stakeholders

W6: Visit to State Department and Bureau of Northern Ireland, DC (Optional)

W7: Group 4 leads discussion

Course Requirements

Pre-departure Participation (35%)

Reading papers (15%)

- As part of our preparation for our visit, you will write a total of four weekly reading papers that explore one or more analytical topic related to issues in Ireland and Northern Ireland. Submit these papers through Collab the night before class; bring a hard copy to class.
- These are not generalized papers, but prompts to specific questions.

Group-based discussion leading (10%)

- Each team is assigned to lead discussion for one session. The job for this team is to read more carefully, foster discussion with class, highlight major issues for us to consider, and bring in outside reading to supplement our discussion

Discussion participation (10%)

- Say smart things in class

In-Ireland program participation (25%)

- The program in Ireland and Northern Ireland calls for significant informal leadership. Our crew will be meeting with experts, asking questions, synthesizing information, and collectively debriefing.
- I'll look for engagement with speakers, mental preparation to engage complicated topics, and leadership in debriefing.
- I'll ask you to take lead on short notice for a given topic or day

Policy memos (30%) – Team-based; two done before trip; one afterward

- Working in teams, each group will craft a series of memos on an agreed upon topic
 - Pre-departure
 - Problem definition memo: 10% (3-5 single spaced pages, first draft due W3; Final Draft due W5)
 - Stakeholders memo: 10% (3-5 single spaced pages, first draft due W5; final draft due W7)
 - Post-departure
 - Options and recommendation memo:10% (3-5 single spaced pages, due W10)
 - How does your recommendation accommodate the problem and engage stakeholders? Why is it better to alternatives? What contingencies are at play?

Meeting dates and schedule

I retreated to the cool of the Prado.
Goya's 'Shootings of the Third of May'
Covered a wall - the thrown-up arms
And spasm of the rebel, the helmeted
And knapsacked militaty, the efficient
Rake of the fusillade.ⁱⁱⁱ

W1: Goals: Background, history, shifting demographics, players

- Reading: Lijphart, Arend. 1975. Review Article: The Northern Ireland Problem; Cases, Theories, and Solutions. *British Journal of Political Science* 5:83-106.
- Tannam, Etain. 2013. "The Divided Irish." In *Divided Nations and European Integration*, Edited by Tristan James Mabry et. al. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- First hour: class overview & study abroad (Kathleen McLaren-Hawking, Education Abroad Advisor)
- Second hour: background

Be advised my passport's green.
No glass of ours was ever raised
to toast the Queen.^{iv}

W2: 1998 Good Friday Agreement and the early peace

Goals: Understanding theories connected to consociationalism and understanding how consociationalism informed the Good Friday Agreement

Response: Consociationalism informed the Good Friday Agreement. Given demographics, does this make sense? What other options should have been or could still be considered?

- McGarry, John. 2001. *Northern Ireland and the Divided World: The Northern Ireland Conflict and the Good Friday Agreement in Comparative Perspective*. Oxford University Press (Chapters 1-4; E-book at UVA Library)
- Wolff, Stefan. 2003. "Between Stability and Collapse: Internal and External Dynamics of Post-Agreement Institution-building in Northern Ireland." *The Global Review of Ethnopolitics: Special Issue on Northern Ireland*. pp. 8-21.
- Gilligan, Chris. 2003. "Constant Crisis/Permanent Process: Diminished Agency and Weak Structures in the Northern Ireland Peace Process." *The Global Review of Ethnopolitics: Special Issue on Northern Ireland*. pp. 22-38.

W3: Gerry Adams and Ian Paisley; Power sharing in the mid 2000s

Goal: Update knowledge from 1998 to power-sharing period and contemporary N. Ireland

- Clancy, Mary-Alice C. 2010. *Peace Without Consensus: Power Sharing in Northern Ireland*. Ashgate Publishing Co. Burlington, VT. Selections. (E-book at UVA Library); read Chapters 3, 4, and 5. Skim others.
- *Response: What do these chapters teach us about leadership?*

Terraced thousands died, shaking scythes at cannon.
The hillside blushed, soaked in our broken wave.
They buried us without shroud or coffin
And in August... the barley grew up out of our grave.^v

W4: Localized conflict in Derry and Belfast

- *Divided Cities*. Chapter 1, 4, 8. (UVA Library E-Book).
- Shirlow, Peter. 2003. "'Who Fears to Speak': Fear, Mobility, and Ethno-sectarianism in the Two 'Ardoynes'." *The Global Review of Ethnopolitics: Special Issue on Northern Ireland*. pp. 76-91.
- Jarman, Neil. 2003. "From Outrage to Apathy? The Disputes over Parades, 1995-2003." *The Global Review of Ethnopolitics: Special Issue on Northern Ireland*. pp. 92-105.
Groups 3 & 4:
- *Response: What steps could be taken to move to a more integrated society? Why would they work?*

W5: Localized conflict in Derry and Belfast

- O Dochartaigh, Niall. 2005. *From Civil Rights to Armalites: Derry and the Birth of the Irish Troubles*. Palgrave. (Selections)
- *Response: The descent into violence is well described within these chapters. How might different actors have made different choices to escape violence as an outcome? Where are the critical mistakes and turning points?*

W6: Honing in on the Rules: Elections

- Reilly, Benjamin. 2004. *Democracy in Divided Societies: Electoral Engineering for Conflict Management*. New York: Cambridge University Press. (UVA Library E-Book). Chapters 1, 2, and 6.
- Garry, John. 2016. *Consociation and Voting in Northern Ireland*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press. (Selections on Collab)
- *Response: To what degree is the stability post-1998 attributable to STNV? Should the US think more clearly about its electoral system? What lessons can be learned from NI?*

W6 (Friday): Optional visit to DC; NOT CONFIRMED

- 8:00 a.m. Travel to Washington, DC (carpool)
- 11:30 a.m. Lunch with Northern Ireland Bureau
- 2:30 p.m. Briefing at US Department of State
- 4 p.m. Travel to Charlottesville

He had unstrapped
The heavy ledger, and my father
Was making tillage returns
In acres, roods, and perches.

Arithmetic and fear
I sat staring at the polished holster
With its buttoned flap, the braid cord
Looped into the revolver butt.^{vi}

W7: Honing in on the Rules: Policing

- Ellison, Graham, and Jim Smyth. 2000. *The Crowned Harp: Policing Northern Ireland*. Selections. (UVA Library E-Book).
- *Response: Police reform is a challenge for modern Northern Ireland. What should be done to encourage more Catholics to join the police force?*

I missed his funeral,
Those quiet walkers
And sideways talkers
Shoaling out of his lane
To the respectable
Purring of the hearse ...
They move in equal pace
With the habitual
Slow consolation
Of a dawdling engine,
The line lifted, hand
Over fist, cold sunshine
On the water, the land
Banked under fog^{vii}

W8: In Ireland/N. Ireland (see separate itinerary)

W10: Debrief and begin work on policy recommendations

W11: Presentations and wrap up lunch!

This morning from the dewy motorway
I saw the new camp for the internees:
A bomb had left a crater of fresh clay
In the roadside, and over in the trees

Machine-gun posts defined a real stockade.
There was that white mist you get on a low ground
And it was deja-vu, some film made
of Stalag 17, a bad dream with no sound.^{viii}

Supplementary Readings

- Cochrane, Feargal. 2013. *Northern Ireland: The Reluctant Peace*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press. (pp.6-66)

ⁱ Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "Station Island".

ⁱⁱ Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "Sibyl".

ⁱⁱⁱ Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "September 1969".

^{iv} Heaney, Seamus. 1982. Untitled.

^v Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "Requiem for the Croppies".

^{vi} Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "A Constable Calls".

^{vii} Heaney, Seamus. 1990. *Selected Poems 1966-1987*. Excerpt from "Casualty".

^{viii} Heaney, Seamus. 1975. *North*. Excerpt from "Whatever you say, say nothing."